# This is the final draft of the contribution published as:

Bastida, F., **Jehmlich, N.**, Martínez-Navarro, J., Bayona, V., García, C., Moreno, J.L. (2019): The effects of struvite and sewage sludge on plant yield and the microbial community of a semiarid Mediterranean soil *Geoderma* **337**, 1051 – 1057

# The publisher's version is available at:

http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.geoderma.2018.10.046

The effects of struvite and sewage sludge on plant yield and the microbial
 community of a semiarid Mediterranean soil

3 F. Bastida, N. Jehmlich, J. Martínez, V. Bayona, C. García, J.L. Moreno

4

5 Abstract

6 Phosphorus (P) limitation will play a key role in the productivity of agriculture in the7 coming decades. Struvite is

8 an ammonium magnesium phosphate mineral that can be recovered from wastewater-9 treatment plants and can

be considered as an alternative source of P. However, the impact of struvite on the plant 10 yield and, particularly, on the soil microbial community is barely known. Here, we 11 12 tested the impacts of struvite, sewage sludge, and their combination on the barley yield, 13 soil macro and micronutrients, and biochemical and microbiological soil properties. Amendment with struvite alone and its combination with sludge increased the 14 availability of P in soil, the plant uptake of P and Mg, and the barley yield. The analysis 15 16 of phospholipid fatty acids (PLFAs) and the utilization of metaproteomics approaches revealed significant effects of struvite on the biomass of Gram-positive bacteria and, 17 particularly, on actinobacterial and verrucomicrobial populations in soil. 18

19

20 *Keywords*: phosphorus; struvite; sludge; soil microbial community; PLFAs;

21 metaproteomics

22

## 23 Introduction

Phosphate rock is a non-renewable resource that will be exhausted 70-100 years from 24 now (Cordell et al., 2009) and there is no substitute for phosphorus (P) in nature (US 25 Geological Survey, 2005; Kim et al., 2018). In consequence, it is expected that P 26 limitation will play a pivotal role in the agricultural productivity in the coming decades. 27 28 Further, there are stringent regulations about contaminants from rock phosphate (i.e. 29 cadmium) (Pizzol et al., 2014). If we take together the predicted limitations in P supply and the growth of the human population, the consequence is immediate: we need to 30 explore sustainable sources of P in order to maintain agricultural productivity (Desmidt 31 32 et al., 2015).

Sewage sludge has an abundant content of macro and micronutrients. However, it may 33 34 also contain undesirable components such as heavy metals, pathogens, or some emergent pollutants. The application of sewage sludge has been proved to benefit soil 35 quality in semiarid environments (Bastida et al., 2008; 2009; Torres et al., 2015), but 36 ideally its application should follow some type of previous sanitization and stabilization 37 treatment, such as composting. Due to the relatively high P content of sewage sludge, its 38 addition to soil is one option for the potential recycling of P. Although the major part of 39 sewage sludge is composted (60-90% of the sewage sludge produced in UK, Ireland, 40 Spain, France, or Luxemburg; Kelessidis and Stasinakis, 2012), most of the remainder 41 is incinerated. Consequently, substantial amounts of P from this organic amendment are 42 43 lost with regard to agriculture. Additionally, P from fertilizers and detergents is directly discharged into water bodies and the excessive P content is causing pollution and 44 45 eutrophication of some aquatic habitats (Chen et al., 2017).

Phosphorus can be recovered at municipal wastewater-treatment plants from the 46 47 supernatant resulting from anaerobic sludge digestion, through the crystallization of ammonium magnesium phosphate mineral struvite, an with the formula 48 MgNH<sub>4</sub>PO<sub>4</sub>.6H<sub>2</sub>O (Shu et al., 2006; Plaza et al., 2007). Struvite can be considered an 49 alternative source of P, nitrogen (N), and magnesium (Mg) for agricultural purposes 50 (Doyle & Parsons, 2002; Gilbert, 2009). Although it has been indicated that struvite has 51 a low solubility - pure MgNH<sub>4</sub>PO<sub>4</sub>.6H<sub>2</sub>O has a solubility of around 0.2 g  $L^{-1}$  (Cabeza et 52 al., 2011) - several studies have found that struvite from sewage sludge is as effective as 53 superphosphate alone for the promotion of dry matter production and P uptake in plants 54 (Plaza et al., 2007; Massey et al., 2009; Uysal et al., 2010). This suggests that P 55 solubilization from struvite occurs, at least partially, in soil. 56

In the sustainability of agroecosystems, the soil microbial community is critical because 57 it plays a paramount role in soil fertility. For instance, microbes drive organic matter 58 59 decomposition and fixation in soil (Paul, 2007), these reactions being catalyzed by a suite of enzymes related to the C, N, and P cycles (Bastida et al., 2008; Burns et al., 60 2013; Garcia et al., 1994). Furthermore, microbial parameters, such as those related to 61 biomass, activity, or diversity, are often considered as highly sensitive (Bastida et al., 62 2008) and are influenced by fertilization practices (Moreno et al., 2008). Among the 63 most novel approaches for the characterization of the diversity and functionality of the 64 soil microbial community, metaproteomics provides more straightforward information 65 about the active microbial populations and their functional roles in soil through the 66 67 direct identification of microbial proteins (Keiblinger et al. 2012; Bastida and Jehmlich, 2015; Bastida et al., 2016; 2017; Hettich et al., 2013; Hultman et al., 2015). 68

Although a positive agronomic effect of struvite on the yield and P uptake has been
observed for several crops (Plaza et al., 2007; González-Ponce et al., 2009; Cabeza et

71 al., 2011), its effects in the soil microbial community are not known. Here, we evaluate 72 the impacts of struvite and its co-synergic effects with sewage sludge on the yield of barley (Hordeum vulgare L.) and on the soil microbial community. For this purpose, we 73 74 applied a multimethod approach involving phospholipid fatty acids (PLFAs), enzyme activities, and metaproteomics. We standardized the soil amendment treatments (sewage 75 sludge, struvite, and their combination) with respect to the P requirements of barley. 76 Given the different contents of macro and micronutrients in sludge and struvite, we 77 hypothesize that their combined use will benefit plant yield in a synergistic way, distinct 78 from that of the single use of either of these materials, and will impact the overall soil 79 80 microbial community. Further, the use of struvite alone, which is more "mineral" and more highly enriched in P, N, and Mg than sludge, should increase P and Mg 81 82 accumulation in plants and affect specific microbial populations.

83

## 84 Material and Methods

#### 85 Experimental design

A one-month pot experiment was carried out under controlled conditions in a plant 86 growth chamber. Three amendment treatments (struvite, sewage sludge, and struvite 87 plus sewage sludge) and a control (unamended soil) were tested, using barley as an 88 89 indicator crop. Struvite can be considered as a potential mineral with a very high content of P, but also N and Mg; while sewage sludge is used in some tree crops as an 90 organic amendment of soil due to its high contents of organic C and available N, 91 besides a considerable amount of organic P. The soil utilized is classified as a Calcic 92 Xerosol (FAO-UNESCO 2003) and it was sampled from an abandoned agricultural plot 93 located in South-eastern Spain. This soil is characterized by a sandy loam texture and 94

95 the following main nutrient concentrations: organic C=2.73%, total N=0.17%, and 96 available P=1.95 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>. After sampling, the soil was sieved (2 mm) prior to being 97 placed in plastic pots.

The struvite and sewage sludge were obtained from a wastewater-treatment plant. The dosage of these materials added to the soil was calculated on the basis of the P fertilization recommendation for barley crops (84 kg  $P_2O_5$  ha<sup>-1</sup>). Thus, the doses added were: 11.66 mg of struvite and 80.63 mg of sewage sludge per 100 g soil (dw) and onehalf of these doses in the combined treatment with both materials. The chemical characterization of the struvite and sewage sludge is shown in Table 1. These materials were air dried and milled prior to mixing them with soil.

The plastic pots containing soil were pre-incubated at 50% of the water-holding 105 capacity (WHC) for five days, at an air temperature of 25 °C and an air relative 106 humidity of 65%. This pre-incubation was performed in order to avoid confounding 107 effects of humidity on soil microbial parameters. After that, ten barley seeds were sown 108 109 in each microcosm and maintained under the same air and soil conditions of temperature and moisture. Periodically, distilled water was added to the soil to maintain 110 111 the soil moisture at around 50% of the WHC. Two soil sampling times were established: one before sowing and another at the end of the plant growth experiment (after one 112 month). At this time, the plant height and the number (%) of germinated seeds were 113 measured. The barley plants of each pot were cut and the aerial biomass was weighed 114 115 (fresh weight); after this, the biomass was dried in an oven at 60 °C and then weighed again (dry weight). The dried plant tissues were placed in plastic bags, which were then 116 117 sealed, and the soil samples were split into two portions: one was stored at 4 °C for the chemical and biochemical analyses, and the other was stored at -20 °C for the 118 metaproteomic analysis. 119

The total N and total organic C (TOC) in the soil were analyzed using an Elemental Analyzer (C/N Flash EA 112 Series-Leco Truspec). Bioavailable phosphorus (P<sub>av</sub>) in the soil was extracted with 0.5 M NaHCO<sub>3</sub> and measured by following the method described by Olsen and Sommers (1982). The total contents of P, K, Ca, micronutrients, and heavy metals in the soil, struvite, sewage sludge, and plant tissues were determined, after nitric-perchloric acid digestion, using an ICP-OES spectrometer (ICAP 6500 DUO; Thermo-Scientific, Waltham, MA, USA).

Urease activity (URA) was determined as the NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> released in the hydrolytic reaction 128 129 using urea as substrate and borate buffer (pH 10), as reported by Kandeler and Gerber (1988). The soil-substrate mixture was incubated in the buffer solution for 2 h at 37 °C. 130 Alkaline phosphomonoesterase (APA) and β-glucosidase (BGA) activities were 131 analyzed by the methods of Tabatabai and Bremner (1969) and Eivazi and Tabatabai 132 (1988), respectively. Two milliliters of MUB (Modified Universal Buffer), pH 6.5 for 133 134 the  $\beta$ -glucosidase assay and pH 11 for the alkaline phosphomonoesterase assay, and 0.5 ml of *p*-nitrophenyl substrate (*p*-nitrophenyl- $\beta$ -D-glucopyranoside for  $\beta$ -glucosidase and 135 *p*-nitrophenyl phosphate for alkaline phosphatase) were added to 0.5 g of soil. The 136 mixtures were incubated at 37 °C for 1 h. Then, the p-nitrophenol released was 137 measured by colorimetry in a UV-visible spectrophotometer (Helios Alpha, Thermo, 138 UK) at 400 nm. 139

Phospholipids were extracted from 6 g of soil using chloroform-methanol extraction, as described by Bligh & Dyer (1959), and were fractionated and quantified using the procedure of Frostegard et al. (1993). The phospholipids were transformed into fatty acid methyl esters (FAMEs) by alkaline methanolysis and designated as described by

Frostegard et al. (1993). The complete dried FAME fraction was dissolved in isooctane 144 containing 0.23 mg mL<sup>-1</sup> of 21:0 FAME as internal standard. The analysis was 145 146 performed using a Trace Ultra Thermo Scientific gas chromatograph fitted with a 60-m capillary column (Thermo TR-FAME, 60 m x 0.25 mm ID x 0.25 µm film), using 147 helium as carrier gas. The following fatty acids are characteristic bacterial fatty acids 148 and were chosen as bacterial biomarkers: i15:0, a15:0, 15:0, i16:0, i17:0, cy17:0, 149  $cy19:0, 16:1\omega7c, 16:1\omega7t, 18:1\omega9c, and 18:1\omega9t$ . The fatty acid  $18:2\omega6$  was used as an 150 151 indicator of fungal biomass. The Gram-positive representative fatty acids used were i15:0, a15:0, i16:0, and i17:0. The Gram-negative fatty acids used were cy17:0, cy19:0, 152 16:1007c, 16:1007t, 18:1009c, and 18:1009t. The 10Me-branched FAMES (10Me16:0 and 153 10Me18:0) were taken as specific actinobacterial biomarkers within the Gram-positive 154 155 bacteria.

156

# 157 Protein extraction from soil and mass spectrometric analysis

Protein extraction was performed according to the method described by Chourey et al. 158 (2010), which has been found to be suitable for semiarid soils (Bastida et al., 2014). The 159 cell lysis and disruption of soil aggregates were performed by boiling at 100 °C for 10 160 min in sodium dodecyl sulfate (SDS) buffer. The proteins were separated by SDS-161 162 PAGE and, after electrophoresis, the gels were stained using colloidal Coomassie 163 brilliant blue. The gel area containing the protein mixture of each sample was sliced into one piece. The samples were further processed by in-gel reduction and alkylation of 164 165 cysteine residues, in-gel tryptic cleavage, and elution as well as desalting of tryptic peptides (Bastida et al., 2016). The peptide lysates were reconstituted in 0.1% formic 166 167 acid prior to LC-MS measurement.

Separation of peptide lysates was performed using an 85-min, non-linear gradient from 168 3.2% to 80% acetonitrile, in 0.1% formic acid, on a C18 analytical column (Acclaim 169 PepMap100, 75 µm inner diameter, 25 cm, C18, Thermo Scientific) in a UHPLC system 170 Dionex/Thermo Fisher Scientific, Idstein, Germany). Mass 171 (Ultimate 3000, spectrometry was performed on a Q Exactive HF MS (Thermo Fisher Scientific, 172 Waltham, MA, USA) with a TriVersa NanoMate (Advion, Ltd., Harlow, UK) source in 173 LC chip coupling mode. The mass spectrometer full scans were measured in the 174 175 Orbitrap mass analyzer within the mass range of 350-1,550 m/z, at 60,000 resolution, using an automatic gain control target of  $1 \times 10^6$  and a maximum fill time of 100 ms. An 176 MS/MS isolation window for ions in the quadrupole was set to 1.4 m/z. The MS/MS 177 scans were acquired using the higher energy dissociation mode at a normalized 178 collision-induced energy of 28%, within a scan range of 200–2,000 m/z and using a 179 180 resolution of 15,000. The exclusion time to reject masses from repetitive MS/MS fragmentation was set to 30 s 181

182 Proteome Discoverer (v1.4, Thermo Scientific) was used for protein identification and 183 the MS/MS spectra acquired were searched with Sequest HT against the specific semiarid soil metagenome database (containing 48,094,830 protein-coding sequences) 184 (Bastida et al., 2017). Enzyme specificity was selected to trypsin with up to two missed 185 186 cleavages allowed, using 5 ppm peptide ion tolerance and 0.02 Da MS/MS tolerances. Oxidation (methionine) selected variable modification 187 was as a and carbamidomethylation (cysteine) as a static modification. Only peptides with a false 188 discovery rate (FDR) <0.01, calculated by Percolator (Käll et al., 2007), and a peptide 189 rank of 1 were considered as identified. 190

The mass spectrometry data were deposited with the ProteomeXchange Consortium via
the PRIDE partner repository (Vizcaino *et al.*, 2013), with the dataset identifier
XXXXXXX.

The "PROteomics results Pruning & Homology group ANotation Engine" 194 (PROPHANE) (http://www.prophane.de) was applied to assign proteins to their 195 196 phylogenetic and functional origin. The composition of the bacterial community was 197 calculated based on the normalized spectral abundance factor (NSAF) at the phylum and order levels. In total, 1,995 protein groups with 3,889 peptides were identified in the 198 199 soil samples. In metaproteomics studies, the number of unique peptides and also the 200 peptide count per protein are generally low. All peptides analyzed here were measured in high-resolution mode, which means that the quality and confirmation of identity are 201 202 of high fidelity.

203 Data analysis

One-way ANOVA was used to determine significant effects of the soil amendment with struvite and sewage sludge on soil parameters. The Tukey post-hoc test was used for multiple comparison of the average values of each variable across the soil treatments and the sampling times, and to determine significant differences at P<0.05.

208

### 209 **Results**

210 Macro and micronutrients in sludge and struvite

The contents of N, P, Mg, and Mn were greater in struvite than in sewage sludge (Table 1). The P, Mn, and Mg contents of struvite were nearly 7, 3, and 11-times greater, respectively, than in sludge. In contrast, the rest of the elements (including organic C) were more abundant in sludge. The contents of heavy metals and other trace elementswere all lower in struvite than in sludge.

## 216 Soil macronutrients, enzyme activities, and PLFA content

At the initial sampling time, the available P ( $P_{av}$ ) content was significantly higher in the soil amended with struvite (St) than in the soil amended with both sludge and struvite (Sl+St) (P<0.05) (Table 2). The soils of these two treatments had a higher  $P_{av}$  content than the control soil and the sludge-amended soil (Sl). The BGA of the soil receiving the combined amendment was lower than that of the control and sludge-amended soils at the initial time.

At the second sampling time (one month), the  $P_{av}$  content was highest in the St soil, followed by the combined treatment (S1+St). The control and sludge-amended soils showed the lowest  $P_{av}$  contents (Table 2). At this time, the control and St samples had the highest N contents. The soil APA was lowest in the struvite treatment and highest in the control soil without amendment. There were no significant differences between treatments in the case of soil URA and BGA at the second sampling time.

There were no differences in the fungal PLFA content between treatments. However, the bacterial PLFA contents of the amended soils were higher than that of the control (P<0.05) (Table 3). The bacterial PLFA content was highest in the St soil, followed by the Sl soil. The content of Gram-positive PLFAs was higher in the St soil than in the Sl+St and Sl soils (P<0.05). The control soil showed the lowest PLFA content. In the case of Gram-negative PLFAs, the content was higher in the St and Sl soils than in the control and Sl+St soils.

236 Plant productivity and plant elements

The highest fresh and dry weights of barley were observed in the combined treatment (P<0.05). The control plants had a lower fresh weight than the rest of the treatments (P<0.05) (Table 4).

The plants in the SI-amended and St-amended soils, and in the combined treatment, had higher P contents than the plants in the control soil (Table 5). Moreover, plants growing in St-amended soil had a significantly higher Mg content than those of the other treatments. The analysis of the elemental contents in the plant tissue revealed no significant differences between treatments in the case of N, C, and K.

245 Composition of the microbial community, analyzed through metaproteomics

Regarding the protein content, the bacterial community at the phylum level was
dominated by *Proteobacteria*, *Actinobacteria*, *Acidobacteria*, and *Planctomycetes* (Fig.
1A). The amendments only affected significantly the abundance of proteins from *Verrucomicrobia* (the protein content was greatest in the St treatment) and *Cyanobacteria* (the protein content was greatest in the S1 treatment).

At the order level, soil amendment influenced the protein abundance of *Nitrosomonadales* (the lowest content was in the combined treatment), and particularly several Actinobacterial orders (P<0.05) (Fig. 1B). The abundance of *Micronosporales* proteins was higher in all the amended treatments in comparison to the control; the abundance of proteins from *Pseudonocardiales* and *Corynebacteruales* was greatest in the combined treatment; and, conversely, the abundance of *Rubrobacterales* proteins was lower in the combined treatment and in the SI-amended soil than in the control.

At the genus level, proteins from *Streptomyces* were more abundant in St-amended and SI-amended soil than in the control (Fig. 1C). The abundance of proteins from 260 *Methylobacterium* was higher in Sl+St than in the control or Sl treatments.
261 *Pseudomonas* and *Gemmatirosa* proteins were more abundant in the Sl treatment.

262

# 263 **Discussion**

264 The availability of P was highest in struvite-amended (St) soil, followed by the 265 combined treatment (Sl+St). The availability of P was lower at one month, but followed 266 the same pattern, with St and SI+St samples having the highest values. The reduction of 267 P availability in both treatments at one month could be the result of P precipitation as Al, Fe, and Ca phosphates (Paul, 2007; Kruse et al., 2015), immobilization in clay 268 particles, and plant uptake. In agreement, plant P uptake from St-treated soil was double 269 270 that in the control. Indeed, it has been indicated that struvite-derived P can be easily taken up by plants (González-Ponce et al., 2009; Cabeza et al., 2011). 271

272 Several studies have observed higher plant fresh weight and P, Mg, N, K, and Ca uptake 273 in struvite-amended soils, in comparison to other sources of P, such as superphosphate 274 (Plaza et al., 2007). Nevertheless, some authors found that the higher yield and plant P uptake obtained with struvite addition to soil, in comparison to superphosphate, were 275 276 attributable to the greater Mg content and uptake in plants and its synergic effects with P uptake in plant tissues (González-Ponce et al., 2009). In our study, the plant Mg 277 278 uptake was highest in the St treatment, followed by the SI+St combination. Magnesium is part of the chlorophyll molecule, which is essential for photosynthesis and hence for 279 plant growth (Mengel and Kirby, 2004). A synergic effect of struvite and sludge has 280 been observed here for barley yield (both dry and fresh weight). These results can be 281 explained by the synergy between the higher Mg content of the struvite and the elevated 282 283 content of other macro and micronutrients - such as K, Ca, Na, Fe, and Cu - provided with the sludge. In other words, struvite can palliate a potential deficiency of Mg in soil
and benefit plant yield (Choudhury and Khani, 2001; González-Ponce et al., 2009).

In spite of their importance in soil fertility and functionality, and crop yields, there is 286 287 little knowledge (if any) about the impacts of struvite in the soil microbial community. Interestingly, in this work the amendments had no effect on the urease and  $\beta$ -288 289 glucosidase activities; this indicates that struvite has no potential impact on the cycles of 290 N and C, respectively, which are, in part, related to these enzymes (Shi, 2011). However, the phosphatase activity was inhibited by struvite. The synthesis and activity 291 292 of extracellular hydrolases in soil are regulated by feedback mechanisms (Allison & 293 Vitousek, 2005; Burns et al., 2013; Sinsabaugh & Moorhead, 1994), so the higher P 294 availability in soil amended with struvite would explain the reduced phosphatase activity. Indeed, we found a negative correlation between phosphatase activity and the 295 P<sub>av</sub> concentration (r=-0.79; P=0.002). 296

The PLFAs were used as indicators of microbial biomass. Fungal biomass was not 297 298 influenced by any treatment. However, bacterial biomass was positively influenced by all amendment treatments. Organic amendment can stimulate the growth and biomass of 299 300 the soil microbial community as a consequence of the supply of C and N (Bastida et al., 301 2008; Torres et al., 2015). In particular, the Gram-positive to Gram-negative biomass ratio was higher for the St and Sl+St treatments. This trend in the G+/G- PLFA ratio 302 matched the higher P availability in these treatments, as reinforced by the positive and 303 304 significant correlation between Pav and the Gram+ PLFA content (r=0.66; P=0.018).

305 Despite their value as indicators of the microbial biomass, fatty acids do not provide 306 accurate information about the composition of the soil microbial community. In the last 307 few years, metaproteomics has been suggested as an alternative approach to track the

composition and diversity of the microbial communities, with special focus on the 308 active populations (Keiblinger et al., 2012; Bastida et al., 2014; 2017; Hultman et al., 309 2015). Here, we found that, at the phylum level, the addition of agronomic doses of 310 sludge or struvite did not influence the composition of the dominant soil bacterial phyla. 311 312 However, when looking in detail at the order level, it was obvious that our treatments, and particularly struvite, had a notable impact on the abundance of Actinobacterial 313 populations. For instance, the application of struvite increased the abundance of 314 315 Streptomycetales, in comparison to the other treatments, while the joint application of increased the abundance of Pseudonocardiales 316 struvite and sludge and Corynebacteriales. So far, it has been generally assumed that Actinobacteria are 317 important as P solubilizers, both in wastewater plants (Bond et al., 1999) and in soil 318 environments (Mander et al., 2012; Wakelin et al., 2012). A recent article by Zheng et 319 320 al. (2017) concluded that more than 90% of the inorganic-P-solubilizing bacterial community in soil corresponds to Actinobacteria and Firmicutes, including 321 322 Streptomyces.

Interestingly, we found evidence that some Actinobacterial populations were related to greater plant yield. For instance, we found positive correlations between the amount of Actinobacterial proteins and the plant fresh (r=0.58; P=0.019) and dry (r=0.50; P=0.048) weight. Among the Actinobacterial proteins, those of Micromonosporales (r=0.73; P=0.001) and Pseudonocardiales (r=0.72; P=0.002) were strongly correlated to the plant fresh weight.

329

330 Conclusions

Soil amendment with struvite - alone or in combination with sewage sludge - increased
the available P concentration in soil, the uptake of both P and Mg by barley, and the
barley yield. These findings corroborate the potential usefulness of struvite as a mineral
P-fertilizer, together with an organic amendment (i.e. sewage sludge), in agriculture.

Moreover, the study reveals the microbial mechanism behind the effects of struvite application to soil. A positive effect of struvite, when added to soil alone or jointly with sludge, on the Gram-positive to Gram-negative biomass ratio was demonstrated. Among the Gram-positive bacteria, metaproteomics revealed that struvite had a strong impact in some actinobacterial populations that may play a role in P solubilization and plant growth.

Further studies with these alternative P-resources - as mineral and organic fertilizers, respectively, at the field scale and with different doses and crops - will be necessary to determine the practical applications of struvite in agriculture.

344

# 345 Acknowledgements

The authors thank the Spanish Ministry, for the CICYT project AGL2017-85755, the Séneca Foundation (19896/GERM/15), and the CSIC project 201740I008. The authors declare that there is no conflict of interest.

349

350

351 **References** 

| 352 | Kelessidis, | A.,   | and    | Stasinakis, | A   | .S. Com | parative | stuc | dy of | the | methods 1 | used for |
|-----|-------------|-------|--------|-------------|-----|---------|----------|------|-------|-----|-----------|----------|
| 353 | treatment a | Ind   | final  | disposal    | of  | sewage  | sludge   | in   | Europ | ean | countries | , Waste  |
| 354 | Managemer   | nt 32 | 2 (201 | 2) 1186-1   | 195 |         |          |      |       |     |           |          |

Paul, E.A. (2007) Soil Microbiology, Ecology and Biochemistry. 3<sup>rd</sup> Edition,
Academic Press, Burlington, MA, USA.

Shi, W (2011). Agricultural and Ecological Significance of Soil Enzymes: Soil
Carbon Sequestration and Nutrient Cycling. In: G. Shukla and A. Varma (eds.), Soil
Enzymology, Soil Biology 22, Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg.

360

- Allison, S.D., Vitousek, P.M. 2005. Responses of extracellular enzymes to simple and
  complex nutrient inputs. *Soil Biology & Biochemistry*, **37**(5), 937-944.
- Bastida, F., Zsolnay, A., Hernández, T., García, C. 2008. Past, present and future of soil
  quality indices: A biological perspective. *Geoderma*, 147(3-4), 159-171.
- Burns, R.G., DeForest, J.L., Marxsen, J., Sinsabaugh, R.L., Stromberger, M.E.,
  Wallenstein, M.D., Weintraub, M.N., Zoppini, A. 2013. Soil enzymes in a
  changing environment: Current knowledge and future directions. *Soil Biology & Biochemistry*, 58, 216-234.
- Desmidt, E., Ghyselbrecht, K., Zhang, Y., Pinoy, L., Van der Bruggen, B., Verstraete,
  W., Rabaey, K., Meesschaert, B. 2015. Global Phosphorus Scarcity and FullScale P-Recovery Techniques: A Review. *Critical Reviews in Environmental Science and Technology*, **45**(4), 336-384.
- 373 Doyle, J.D., Parsons, S.A. 2002. Struvite formation, control and recovery. *Water*374 *Research*, 36(16), 3925-3940.

- Eivazi, F., Tabatabai, M.A. 1988. GLUCOSIDASES AND GALACTOSIDASES IN
  SOILS. Soil Biology & Biochemistry, 20(5), 601-606.
- Garcia, C., Hernandez, T., Costa, F. 1994. MICROBIAL ACTIVITY IN SOILS
  UNDER MEDITERRANEAN ENVIRONMENTAL-CONDITIONS. Soil
  Biology & Biochemistry, 26(9), 1185-1191.
- Gilbert, N. 2009. Environment: The disappearing nutrient. *Nature*, **461**(7265), 716-718.
- 381 Kruse, J., Abraham, M., Amelung, W., Baum, C., Bol, R., Kuehn, O., Lewandowski,
- H., Niederberger, J., Oelmann, Y., Rueger, C., Santner, J., Siebers, M., Siebers,
  N., Spohn, M., Vestergren, J., Vogts, A., Leinweber, P. 2015. Innovative
  methods in soil phosphorus research: A review. *Journal of Plant Nutrition and Soil Science*, **178**(1), 43-88.
- Moreno, J.L., Bastida, F., Hernandez, T., Garcia, C. 2008. Relationship between the
   agricultural management of a semi-arid soil and microbiological quality.
   *Communications in Soil Science and Plant Analysis*, **39**(3-4), 421-439.
- 389 Sinsabaugh, R.L., Moorhead, D.L. 1994. RESOURCE-ALLOCATION TO 390 EXTRACELLULAR **ENZYME-PRODUCTION** \_ А MODEL FOR NITROGEN AND PHOSPHORUS CONTROL OF LITTER 391 DECOMPOSITION. Soil Biology & Biochemistry, 26(10), 1305-1311. 392
- Tabatabai, M.A., Bremner, J.M. 1969. Use of p-nitrophenyl phosphate for assay of soil
  phosphatase activity. *Soil Biology and Biochemistry*, 1(4), 301-307.
- Uysal, A., Yilmazel, Y.D., Demirer, G.N. 2010. The determination of fertilizer quality
  of the formed struvite from effluent of a sewage sludge anaerobic digester. *Journal of Hazardous Materials*, 181(1-3), 248-254.

398