# This is the preprint of the contribution published as:

Schunck, F., Liess, M. (2024): Ultra-low esfenvalerate exposure may disrupt interspecific competition *Sci. Total Environ.* **906**, art. 167455

# The publisher's version is available at:

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2023.167455

# **1** Persistent disruption of interspecific competition after ultra-low

# 2 esfenvalerate exposure

3 Florian Schunck †, §, \*; Matthias Liess †, §,

4 † Helmholtz Centre for Environmental Research (UFZ), Dept. of System-Ecotoxicology,
5 Permoserstraße 15, 04318 Leipzig, Germany

6 § Rheinisch-Westfälische Technische Hochschule (RWTH), Institute of Ecology &
7 Computational Life Science, Templergraben 55, 52056 Aachen, Germany

#### 8 Abstract

9 Field and mesocosm studies repeatedly show that higher tier process reduce the predictive 10 accuracy of toxicity evaluation and consequently their value for pesticide risk assessment. 11 Therefore, understanding the influence of ecological complexity on toxicant effects is 12 crucial to improve realism of aquatic risk assessment. Here we investigate the influence of 13 repeated exposure to ecologically realistic concentrations of esfenvalerate on the similarly 14 sensitive species *Daphnia magna* and *Culex pipiens* in a food limited and highly competitive 15 environment. We show that significant perturbations in population development are only 16 present close to the EC<sub>50</sub>. In contrast, interspecific competition between species is already 17 reduced at concentrations 3-4 orders of magnitude below the acute EC<sub>50</sub>. We conclude that 18 extremely low, environmentally relevant concentrations can disrupt species interactions. 19 This toxicant mediated alteration of competitive balances in ecological communities may 20 be the underlying mechanism for shifts in species distribution at ultra-low pesticide 21 concentrations. A realistic risk assessment should therefore consider these processes in 22 order to predict potential pesticide effects on the structure of communities.

Keywords: community, microcosms, hormesis, multiple stress, co-existence, machine-learning

#### 25 Introduction

Effect assessment is centered around screening for toxic effects with single species, single substance tests (European Food Safety Authority 2013). However, a growing number of studies indicate that whenever complex biological systems are exposed to a stressor, results diverge from expectations (Fleeger et al. 2003; Knillmann, Stampfli, Beketov, et al. 2012; Knillmann, Stampfli, Noskov, et al. 2012; Liess et al. 2013; Alexander et al. 2016; Arce-Funck et al. 2016; Vaugeois et al. 2020; Allen et al. 2021). Due to this gap between single species lab experiments and mesocosm experiments, inclusion of species interactions is one of the most important aspects of strengthening risk assessment (Gessner and Tlili 2016). Unfortunately, little progress has been made, as studies considering biological stressors such as species interactions are still underrepresented in literature (He et al. 2023).

37 The population state is an important co-variate for toxic effects of chemicals. Intraspecific 38 competition can delay recovery of the population structure (Liess et al. 2006, Pieters and 39 Liess 2006, Liess and Foit 2010). In the context of ecological communities, the competitive 40 exclusion principle states that complete competitors (i.e., those that compete for exactly the same ecological niche) cannot coexist (Gause 1936; Hardin 1960). In natural 41 42 ecosystems species diversify into their own niche, however, usually some overlap between 43 shared resources remains, allowing for co-existence of competitors (MacArthur 1958; 44 Hawlena et al. 2022). When such communities are exposed to toxicants, altered species-45 species interactions can therefore be expected. This is because usually one species will 46 have a competitive advantage if exposed to a toxicant, due to differences in the species' 47 sensitivity. Interspecific competition can delay recovery of species after disturbances 48 (Knillmann, Stampfli, Noskov, et al. 2012) and increase toxic effects of pesticides 49 (Knillmann, Stampfli, Beketov, et al. 2012). Under repeated lethal exposure to toxicants, the 50 more sensitive species is gradually excluded, even when food density is abundant (Liess et 51 al. 2013). In a synthetic freshwater community, the exposure to acute concentrations of an 52 insecticide lead to reduced abundance in both competitors when they had a comparable 53 sensitivity towards the toxicant and led to compensatory dynamics if sensitivities were 54 different (Mano and Tanaka 2016).

55 How do pesticides alter interactions between competing species; do they cease or do they 56 change when concentrations are far below levels that elicit acute effects? In the field, 57 pesticide exposure 3 orders of magnitude below the EC<sub>50</sub> results in severe degradation of 58 community composition with the loss of sensitive species (Liess et al. 2021). Recently, it 59 has been shown that exposing *D. magna* populations at carrying capacity to esfenvalerate 60 at concentrations 2 orders of magnitude below the acute EC<sub>50</sub> can lead to a long-term 61 increases in population abundance (Schunck and Liess 2023). This reinforces the question 62 of how sub-acute concentrations act at the ecological level of the community.

63 Our aim was to reveal the effects of ultra-low esfenvalerate concentrations on the 64 population development of two competing species (D. magna and C. pipiens) in a food 65 limited system with high competition between the species. For this we set up laboratory nanocosms and repeatedly exposed them with esfenvalerate concentrations as low as 3.5 66 orders of magnitude below the acute EC<sub>50</sub>. The system state was monitored over a period of 67 68 4 months through non-invasive weekly monitoring of species abundance and measurement 69 of physico-chemical parameters to assess the influence of environmental parameters on population development. Finally, effects of esfenvalerate on the interaction strength 70 71 between the competing species *D. magna* and *C. pipiens* were investigated with Bayesian 72 methods.

#### 73 Methods

#### 74 Experiment Design

75 To study the effects of low doses of esfenvalerate on competing populations under limited 76 availability of food and varying environmental conditions, 80 artificial 2-species systems 77 were assembled in November 2020, under controlled temperature (20 ± 1 °C) and light 78 conditions (16:8 day-night cycle). *Daphnia magna* and *Culex pipiens* were selected as 79 competitors, both of which are common invertebrates that dwell in standing freshwater 80 and brackish water bodies (Ebert 2022). While *D. magna* spends its entire life cycle in water, the species *C. pipiens* emerges after an approximately 20 day underwater larval 81 82 stage as an adult mosquito and can reproduce without feeding on animal blood. Both 83 species feed on suspended particles in the water column (Merritt et al. 1992; Ebert 2022) or moved close to the sediment to graze on organic particles of growing periphyton. 84

85 Each experimental unit consisted of a 5.5 L glass beaker (Harzkristall, Derenburg, 86 Germany), filled with 1.5 kg of washed aquarium sand of 1–2 mm diameter. The sediment 87 layer served as a habitat for microorganisms to facilitate self-purification of the systems as 88 well as substrate for periphyton growth. Aachener Daphnien Medium (ADaM) (Klüttgen et 89 al. 1994) was used as the test medium for the experiment. Throughout the duration of the 90 experiment, the medium was not exchanged and kept at a constant volume of 3.5 L by 91 replenishing the beakers with bi-distilled water on a weekly basis. The systems were 92 covered with a polypropylene net to prevent escape of the adult mosquitoes. Two eyelets 93 were embedded in the netting to grant access to the systems for measurement, sampling 94 and supply of glucose solution. Additionally, a reaction vessel was fitted in the netting and 95 immersed in the water column and filled with distilled water itself. This provided access96 for temperature monitoring without cross-contaminating the measurement device.

97 For 5 months, the systems were continuously colonized, while the systems were 98 developing periphyton growth on the sediments, which served as a food source for the 99 organisms. The systems were deliberately left to diverge from the initial homogeneous 100 state to reflect random variation in environmental habitats. In contrast to previously 101 conducted nanocosm experiments (Liess et al. 2006; Foit et al. 2012), no additional food 102 was supplied to the systems after the end of the colonization period. Instead, nutrition 103 came from periphyton growth on the sediments and suspended algae and bacteria in the 104 water column. This set-up was chosen to mimic density dependent processes in natural 105 systems (Halbach 1970) and enforce competition between the two test species. Only adult 106 mosquitoes were provided with a saturated glucose solution to enable reproduction.

#### 107 Water Quality During the Pre-Exposure Period

108 After 5 months of colonization, population monitoring of *C. pipiens* (once per week) and *D.* 109 *magna* (twice per week) began. Those systems, with low emergence rates of adult *C. pipiens* 110 were still populated with larvae and eggs to simulate spawning events for another two 111 months. Physico-chemical parameters were very homogeneous across all systems in the 112 pre-exposure period (temperature 20.2  $\pm$  0.3 °C, conductivity 987  $\pm$  84  $\mu$ S/cm, oxygen 10.1 113  $\pm$  0.5 mg/L, pH 7.3  $\pm$  0.4). Nutrient levels were similar to previously conducted studies 114  $(PO_4: 0.2 \pm 0.1 \text{ mg/L}, NO_3: 0.7 \pm 0.4 \text{ mg/L}, NO_2: 0.02 \pm 0.01 \text{ mg/L}, NH_4: 0.03 \pm 0.04 \text{ mg/L}).$ 115 The median suspended biomass of 0.2 mg/L was in the range of oligotrophic lakes, 116 suggesting that most systems were strongly limited in biomass available for feeding, 117 however measurements had a considerable range (90%-quantile: 0.01–2.97 mg/L). The 118 environmental parameters that characterized the systems are summarized in Table S1 for 119 the pre-exposure period and in Table 1 for the post-exposure period.

#### 120 Exposure

After the 2-month pre-exposure period, the systems were exposed two times to the pyrethroid insecticide esfenvalerate with a recovery period of 1 month between exposures. The treatments consisted of 5 esfenvalerate exposure levels (solvent control, 0.1, 1, 10, 100 ng/L) with a treatment size of 16 replicates each. For the preparation of stock solutions, 5 mg esfenvalerate (CAS 66230-04-4, HPC Standards GmbH, Cunnersdorf, Germany) were dissolved in DMSO and diluted to a concentration of 1000 µg/L, which also served as

127 exposure solution for the highest exposure treatment. From this stock, exposure solutions 128 were diluted to  $100\mu g/L$ ,  $10\mu g/L$  and  $1\mu g/L$ . An additional solution containing DMSO was 129 prepared to serve as the exposure solution for the solvent control. The stocks were 130 prepared on the day preceding the exposure and were kept refrigerated overnight. On the 131 day of exposure, 350  $\mu$ L of the treatment specific exposure solutions were added to the 132 corresponding systems containing 3.5 L ADaM medium, amounting to a solvent 133 concentration of 0.01 % v/v.

134 The accuracy of the exposure concentrations was determined by measuring the 135 concentration of the stock solutions spiked to 1 L samples of freshly prepared ADaM. In 136 addition, 50 ml water samples from 4 randomly selected replicates of the highest exposure treatment (100 ng/L) were taken exactly 1h after exposure and 48 h after exposure. 137 138 Chemical analysis of the tested samples was performed by SGS Analytics Germany GmbH, 139 using a GC-MS. Measured concentrations of stock solutions and samples of experimental replicates are shown in Table S3 and Table S4. The measured concentrations in 140 141 experimental replicates in the highest esfenvalerate treatment are very homogeneously at 142 38.8 ± 11 ng/L, 1 h after exposure and are always below the limit of quantification (LOQ) of 143 20 ng/L after 48h. Rapid dissipation of esfenvalerate from the water column due to 144 adsorption and photo degradation can explain the repaid decay in the first 48h hours after 145 exposure.

#### 146 **Biological assessment of Exposure Concentrations**

147 In addition to chemical analysis of the exposure solutions, the effect of esfenvalerate on 148 standard test organisms was assessed. This was done under standard conditions and in the 149 nanocosm medium. These standardized experiments were conducted in parallel to the 150 exposure of the main experiment. For each test system, 2 x 25 ml beakers were filled with 151 20 ml samples of the test systems 1 hour after exposure. 5 neonates (< 24h) of *D. magna* 152 were placed in one beaker and 5 larvae (< 96 h) of *C. pipiens* in the other and survival was 153 observed for 48 h. During this period, organisms were not fed to approach conditions in the 154 test systems. In addition, the same setup was prepared for each exposure concentration, 155 plus a test concentration of 1000 ng/L, in standard ADaM medium. Populations were 156 monitored for survival for 2 days without feeding (according to OECD acute standard test (OECD 2004)). Figure 1a shows that *C. pipiens* are slightly more sensitive (*Culex*  $EC_{50} = 71$ 157 ng/L, *Daphnia* EC<sub>50</sub> = 176 ng/L) under standard conditions. When tested in the nanocosm 158

medium, *Culex* had 10% higher control mortality also under non-lethal esfenvalerate
concentrations (Fig.1b), while no control mortality was detected in *D. magna*.



161

162 **Figure 1**. Similar sensitivity of *D. magna* (age < 24h) and *C. pipiens* (age < 96 h) after 48h of 163 exposure to esfenvalerate. The reported esfenvalerate  $EC_{50}$  for *D. magna* from EPA 164 database is 310 ± 330 ng/L (Table S2). Survival data were obtained from standard tests conducted in parallel to the 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> exposure of the nanocosm test systems with the 165 same exposure solutions. (a) under standard conditions (*Culex* EC<sub>50</sub> = 71 ng/L, *Daphnia* 166  $EC_{50} = 176 \text{ ng/L}$ ). (b) in samples of experimental units (nanocosms) taken 1h after 167 168 exposure to esfenvalerate (*Culex*  $EC_{50} = 80 \text{ ng/L}$ , *Daphnia*  $EC_{50} = 187 \text{ ng/L}$ ). The squares 169 indicate the EC<sub>50</sub> and shaded areas show the Bayesian credible interval of the estimate. The 170 solid line is the maximum likelihood estimate of a 3-parameter log-logistic function and the 171 dashed line is the Bayesian fit.

#### 172 Monitoring of species abundance

We monitored population development of *D. magna* by taking 3 images of each system with
a Panasonic DC-FZ1000-II (Panasonic Corporation, Kadoma, Japan), twice per week with an
improved image analysis technique compared to the approach developed by Foit et al.
(2012).

177 First, motion was detected by background subtraction; this method is based on differences 178 between two consecutive images. Background subtraction removed all static parts of the 179 image, so that only objects moving in both images remained. Taking the element wise 180 maximum of this difference resulted in only the moving objects of the first image. 181 Depending on the amount of movement in the system, between 100–100 000 detection 182 candidates were generated. Large numbers of proposals occurred when the background 183 was even slightly moving, or the lighting conditions changed during capture. In a second 184 step, the bounding boxes around the coordinates of the detection were analyzed for 185 characteristic properties and stored in a file. These data points comprised the basis for the 186 classification. 50 randomly selected images were annotated based on the candidate 187 proposals. After annotation, a Support Vector Machine (SVM) classifier was trained with 188 the annotated tags from the 50 images. The resulting accuracy of the unseen test set was 189 98%.



**Figure 2**. Validation of the detection method. The manual count indicates the number of organisms identified by visually counting *D. magna* in an image. In contrast, the true count is the actual number of organisms in the vessels determined when the experiment was ended. The predicted count is the number of organisms estimated by the classification algorithm. **(a)** Classifier evaluation of the capacity to detect organism from images. **(b)** Validation of the method by comparison of estimated organism count from image segmentation and classification with the true count from the last day of experimentation.

190

198 Of all labeled *Daphnia*, 97% were correctly classified as such, however an arbitrary 199 detection candidate of a moving object generated a 2% chance of false positive detection, 200 resulting in a slight tendency for over-detection (Fig. 2a). This resulted in problems if a 201 large number of detection candidates was generated (e.g., when the camera was slightly 202 moved during image capture). Therefore, in a 3<sup>rd</sup> step of the analysis, the image with lowest 203 overall difference in pixels was chosen per series. This classification method was then used 204 to detect population abundance in 7680 images taken throughout the experiment. 205 Validation with the true organism count obtained at the end of the experiment shows that 206 approximately 50% of the organisms are detected (Fig. 2b), however, this divergence is 207 consistent throughout the assessed systems, which allows to assess the relative effects in 208 the system.

209 The abundance of larvae of *C. pipiens* was manually counted once per week. Since larvae of 210 *C. pipiens* generally remain static in their positions below the water surface, it was possible 211 to determine accurate population counts. Also, in contrast to automatic detection methods 212 it was easily possible to distinguish between exoskeletons of emerged larvae and their 213 submerged siblings. In order to detect any organisms hiding in the sediments, the systems 214 were gently moved to provoke escape reactions of *Culex* larvae. The abundance of C. larvae 215 directly after hatching is not included in the population count. Only organisms > 1mm were 216 included into the analyses.

Although, the fraction of *D. magna* in the water column was representative of the system state (Fig. 1b), future studies should use more homogeneous, dark sediments to facilitate the detection of organisms on the sediment. The automated detection of slow-moving organisms like *C. pipiens* could be enabled by using permanently installed cameras with longer intervals between images.

#### 222 Sampling and Measurement of Environmental Parameters

223 Weekly, a 5.5 ml sample was taken to measure physico-chemical parameters and cell 224 density. Every second week, additional 20 ml sample was taken to measure the nutrient 225 status of the systems. Greatest care was taken to avoid cross contamination of the systems. 226 Therefore, a syringe was connected with silicon tubing to each nanocosm and reused for 227 the entire duration of the experiment. After sampling, the samples were stored cool until 228 analysis at or measured directly and discarded thereafter. Sampling was conducted in 229 parallel to the monitoring of the systems. Since this process took several hours, variations 230 in the reported parameters due to daily temperature fluctuations are present in the 231 dataset. Medium reductions due to sampling and evaporation were replenished with bi-232 distilled water. Major nutrient concentrations (NO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>3</sub>, NH<sub>4</sub>, PO<sub>4</sub>) were measured every 233 second week with a Photometer (PF-12plus, Macherey-Nagel, Düren, Germany). To 234 increase the accuracy, values were calculated from re-calibrated spectral absorption 235 measurements and estimated concentrations (Fig. S1). Physico-chemical parameters were 236 measured with a multi-parameter device (Portavo 908 Multi, Knick Elektronische 237 Messgeräte GmbH & Co. KG, Berlin, Germany). Density of suspended cells were measured 238 with a CASY-TTC cell counter (Schärfe Systems, Reutlingen, Germany, now OMNI Life 239 Science, Bremen, Germany). The raw count data was passed through a filter, discarding 240 measurements where total counts were < 2, to separate white noise from signal. Data were 241 then smoothed and total volume in  $\mu$ L/L was calculated and estimated as suspended

- biomass density in mg/L assuming a wet weight density of 1 mg/µl (e.g. (Zhu et al. 2021)).
- 243 The pre-exposure measurement values are reported in Table S1.
- **Table 1**: average of environmental parameters per group during post-exposure. Values are
- reported as average across time and replicates and the associated standard deviation.

variable	0.0 ng/L	0.1 ng/L	1.0 ng/L	10 ng/L	100 ng/L
Temperature [°C]	$20.2 \pm 0.3$	$20.1 \pm 0.3$	$20.0 \pm 0.3$	$20.0 \pm 0.3$	$20.2 \pm 0.3$
Conductivity [µS/cm]	969 ± 49	977 ± 53	991 ± 53	997 ± 96	991 ± 78
Oxygen saturation [mg/L]	9.39 ± 0.27	$9.43 \pm 0.37$	9.33 ± 0.3	9.38 ± 0.32	9.34 ± 0.32
рН	$7.12 \pm 0.08$	7.11 ± 0.09	7.13 ± 0.09	7.1 ± 0.08	7.15 ± 0.16
PO4 [mg/L]	$0.45 \pm 0.33$	0.51 ± 0.39	0.77 ± 1.99	0.6 ± 0.89	$0.65 \pm 0.82$
NO3 [mg/L]	$1.42 \pm 0.69$	$1.47 \pm 0.62$	$1.31 \pm 0.62$	$1.44 \pm 0.77$	$1.5 \pm 0.83$
NO2 [mg/L]	$0.03 \pm 0.03$	$0.03 \pm 0.04$	$0.04 \pm 0.05$	$0.03 \pm 0.05$	$0.05 \pm 0.05$
NH4 [mg/L]	$0.0 \pm 0.01$	$0.01 \pm 0.01$	$0.01 \pm 0.02$	$0.01 \pm 0.04$	$0.03 \pm 0.15$
suspended biomass [mg/L]	$0.45 \pm 1.0$	0.41 ± 0.51	0.31 ± 0.3	0.67 ± 1.27	1.56 ± 5.8

The measured levels of N and P were in the range of eutrophic lakes (compare e.g. (Šorf et al. 2015; Beklioğlu et al. 2017)). However, continuously high levels of dissolved levels of oxygen and low densities of suspended cells indicate that the observed nutrient concentrations had no effect on the studied systems. Direct effects of these nutrients are also unlikely since, they were not near high enough to elicit direct effects on *D. magna* (Serra et al. 2019).

252 Statistics



253

Figure 3: Time series smoothing and exemplary disturbance analysis of one experimental unit. (a) shows a running average (solid black line) that has been computed through the time series (blue dots). The lower panels show deviations from the linear pre-exposure trend that has been extrapolated (dashed line). (b) first exposure on the 3<sup>rd</sup> of June 2021 (day 62) (c) 2<sup>nd</sup> exposure on the 30<sup>th</sup> of June 2021 (day 89).

For the entire analysis 17 systems were excluded from subsequent analysis. The detailed reasons for removal are listed in the Supplementary Method S1. For all analyses considering the temporal dynamic of the systems, the time series were smoothed by computing centered running averages with a time window of 11 days (Fig. 3a). This was done to reduce the influence of very short termed fluctuations in the signal, which makes the analysis more robust to measurement errors, but may rarely underestimate true treatment effects such the saw tooth pattern visible in Figure 3a.

#### 266 Disturbance Analysis to Identify Short Term Effects of Esfenvalerate

267 Due to the complexity of the analyzed systems, high variance between experimental 268 replicates complicated the identification of general patterns in the time series. The 269 following analysis was developed to robustly identify immediate effects of the tested 270 esfenvalerate concentrations in replicated time series with high variance between 271 replicates. In smoothed time series, 21–day long segments centered around the exposure 272 events were isolated (Fig. 3a, gray boxes). Then linear trends were computed through the 273 10-day pre-exposure sections (Fig. 3b,c, solid horizontal lines) and were extrapolated to the following 11 days (Fig. 3b,c, dashed horizontal lines). Disturbances were then 274 275 estimated by calculating differences between extrapolated pre-exposure trends and the 276 true development of smoothed time series (Fig. 3b,c, red vertical lines).

The described analysis allows the estimation of low disturbances when the population development is characterized by smooth, non-volatile cycles, which we interpret as normal behavior. On the contrary, high variance in the signal will lead to strong disturbance signals and be indicative of treatment effects.

#### 281 Correlation Analysis to Identify Changes in Interspecific Competition

In the study of interaction between species, measuring the correlations between species
can give insight into their relationship (Moran 1953; Ranta et al. 1995; McCarthy 2011).
Strongly positive correlations between abundance will in theory emerge, when both
species equally respond to low or high levels of resource availability. In essence, when they

are coexisting with significant overlap of shared resources. On the other hand, if the exclusion of either one species occurs, strong negative correlations between species will be observed. Natural systems, repeatedly observed over time, will show correlation coefficients between these extremes. However, trends in either one of the directions are indicative of changes in the relationship between species and will be interpreted as such in this work.

Estimating the correlation between count data is a non-trivial task. The approximation with the Pearson correlation coefficient will underestimate negative correlations due to the constraint of count data to be non-negative. In addition, multivariate Poisson distributions have been previously restricted to positive correlations (Ghosh et al. 2021). Modern Bayesian inference frameworks (Salvatier et al. 2016) allow for flexible transformations of variables, which enabled us to approach the problem by modeling the rate parameters of Poisson distributions as exponentiated multivariate normal variables.

$N_s$	~ $Poisson(\lambda_s)$	(1)
$\lambda_s$	$= e^{\log(\lambda_s)}$	(2)
$\log(\lambda_s)$	~ $MultivariateNormal(mu = \mu_s, covariance = cov)$	(3)
cov	$\sim LKJ(\eta = 1, \sigma_s)$	(4)
$\mu_s$	$\sim Cauchy(0, 1)$	(5)
$\sigma_s$	~ HalfCauchy(1)	(6)

299

300 Weakly informative Cauchy distributions with heavy tails (Gelman et al. 2008; McElreath 301 2015) were used as priors for  $\mu_s$  and  $\sigma_s$ , which describes the log species occurrence rates 302 and their intrinsic deviation. An LKJ prior with uniform probability density over the 303 correlation between the species  $(\eta = 1)$  was used as an uninformed prior for the covariance 304 structure of the multivariate Normal. A calculation example for 3 imaginary test systems: 305 assume the numbers of organisms (*Culex, Daphnia*) in the respective systems were (5, 10), 306 (10, 20) and (20, 40). A correlation coefficient close to 1 would be estimated, although with 307 large HDIs representing the uncertainty, since only 3 samples are given. In an opposing 308 example were (1, 20), (50, 2), (0,0) are observed, a correlation coefficient near –1 would be 309 estimated, representing the observation that at most one species was dominant. An 310 estimation example for a simulated dataset is given in Figure S3, which shows that the 311 correlation coefficient can be estimated very well, even with only 12 samples, which is 312 representative for this study. The 95% highest posterior density interval (HPDI) was 313 computed to calculate credible intervals, which are considered to be the Bayesian analog to 314 confidence intervals. However, in contrast to confidence intervals, a 95% credible interval 315 includes the true parameter value with a 95% probability by definition.

316 Interspecific correlation coefficients, including Bayesian uncertainty estimates were 317 recovered from the covariance matrix, which were estimated for the whole pre- and post-318 exposure datasets (results: Fig. 6) and for each day in the smoothed time series (see Fig. 3) 319 to obtain trends in the interspecific correlation (results: Figs. 4, 7).



#### 320 Results

321

Figure 4. Species abundance per treatment over the time of the experiment in days computed with a Bayesian model of correlated, Poisson distributed variables. The vertical lines indicate the times of exposure to esfenvalerate. Shaded areas are 95% credible intervals and indicate the uncertainty of the estimates. (**a**-**d**) Expected abundance *C. pipiens.* (**e**-**h**) Expected abundance *D. magna.* 

327 Figure 4 shows the development of population densities of the two competing species 328 before and after exposure to esfenvalerate as a treatment average. Larvae populations of C. 329 *pipiens* were stable or increasing in the pre-exposure period with highly variable 330 population densities across replicates, indicated by large credible intervals (Fig. 4a–d). This 331 is attributed to continued stocking of low density *Culex* populations with additional eggs 332 and larvae in the pre-exposure period. Only when stocking was ceased in the post exposure 333 period, negative trends were visible in the population density of *C. pipiens*. In contrast, *D.* 334 *magna* populations, which were not artificially stocked in the pre-exposure period, follow a steady decline over the entire period of the experiment (Fig. 4e–h). In general, the declining 335 population density reflect that the systems were characterized by resource scarcity. This 336 337 corresponds to the low density of suspended organic matter (median 0.21 mg/L, 90%-

quantile: 0.01–2.97 mg/L). As expected, due to the necessity of artificial stocking in the preexposure phase and slightly but significantly higher baseline mortality in nanocosm
medium (Fig. 1b), *C. pipiens* were significantly less abundant than *D. magna* over the entire
duration of the experiment.

342 After exposure to esfenvalerate, average trends of populations exposed to esfenvalerate did 343 not significantly deviate from the controls. Correspondingly, the fraction of low-density 344 populations towards the end of the experiment ( $\leq 10\%$  of the pre-exposure maximum) did 345 not differ between *C. pipiens* and *D. magna*. Also, the physico-chemical parameters were 346 similar across all treatments in the post exposure period (Table 1). Compared to the pre-347 exposure period (Table S1), oxygen saturation slightly decreased by 7%, while the medium 348 pH, conductivity and temperature did not change. Phosphate and Nitrate concentrations 349 approximately doubled in the post-exposure period, while Nitrite and Ammonium did not 350 change. Only suspended biomass differed among treatments; however, the differences are 351 smaller than the standard deviations (Table 1).



353



Figure 5. Average 11-day disturbance of competing populations calculated from the deviation of extrapolated pre-exposure trend (10 days) to observed post exposure development in a 21-day time window (see methods: disturbance analysis). (a) *Daphnia* disturbance after exposures to esfenvalerate. (b) *Culex* disturbance after exposure to esfenvalerate. A significant deviation from the control treatment is indicated by an asterisk.

Figure 5a shows that a concentration of 100 ng/L elicits a significant negative disturbance (-6.0, p = 0.02) on populations of *D. magna*. This is also visible in the volatile trajectory of Figure 4h (100 ng/L). While disturbances after exposure to 100ng/L were negative after both exposures, exposure to concentration  $\leq$  10 ng/L resulted in negative disturbances after the 1<sup>st</sup> exposure and positive disturbances after the 2<sup>nd</sup> exposure. On *C. pipiens*, exposure to esfenvalerate induced no significant short-term disturbances (Fig. 5b). Under standard conditions the species had similar sensitivities to esfenvalerate ( $EC_{50}$  Culex = 80ng/L,  $EC_{50}$  Daphnia = 180 ng/L, Fig. 1). However, these sensitivities were not reproduced on the community level, where *D. magna* is the only species significantly disturbed by exposure to 100 ng/L esfenvalerate. This could be explained by different durations of the observed post exposure period in standard tests (2 days) and the nanocosm test systems (11 days).

#### 371 Changes in Species Correlation after Exposure to Esfenvalerate

372 It was a key question of this work, whether exposure to pesticide influences the 373 interspecific competition at low concentrations. To answer this question, the correlation 374 between abundance of both species over time was evaluated by applying Bayesian 375 estimation of the covariance between two Poisson distributed variables.



376

377 **Figure 6.** (a-d) Population densities of observed *Culex* and *Daphnia* during the entire post 378 exposure period of all experimental replicates. The colored treatments are always 379 compared to the same control dataset (gray). The displayed data-range was truncated to 380 increase visibility of the dataset. Not shown data are indicated by triangles at the upper or 381 right-hand side of the panels. (e-h) Bayesian posterior density estimates of the Daphnia-382 *Culex* correlation coefficient, fitted on the data in panels a-d with the model described in 383 Equations 1–6. High correlations indicate that fluctuations in population density were 384 synchronized, while low correlations indicate that fluctuations in population density were 385 not synchronized.

386 Figure 6a–d shows the pairs of population density of *C. pipiens* and *D. magna* at each 387 observation in the post-exposure period. States with simultaneously high population 388 densities of both *D. magna* and *C. pipiens* were rarely observed. Figure 6c shows the 389 population densities of highly correlated species across multiple systems. The development 390 of *C. pipiens* and *D. magna* populations in these replicates was synchronized, meaning that 391 rarely one species was abundant while the other species was not. Figure 6e-h shows the 392 estimated correlation coefficient between both species in the community. Small concentrations of esfenvalerate increased the correlation between competitors compared 393 394 to the control treatment (Fig. 6e–g). This deviation is significantly positive over the entire 395 post-exposure period in systems that were exposed to 10 ng/L (Fig. 6g). In contrast, 396 exposure to 100 ng/L induced a slightly negative correlation shift between *Culex* and 397 Daphnia. Considering the effect of 100 ng/L on the disturbance of Daphnia population (Fig. 398 5a), the reduction of correlation is a sign of extinction, also visible in the phase-space of 399 Figure 6d, which shows that one or the other species become dominant, while the other is 400 excluded.



402 **Figure 7**. Temporal development of correlation coefficient between abundance of *C. pipiens* 403 and *D. magna* (smoothed time series). Competitive exclusion in the control treatments and 404 100 ng treatments, and synchronized behavior in the three low concentrations. For each 405 day of the time series, the correlation coefficient was estimated that best predicted the 406 abundance pairs of *C. pipiens* and *D. magna* in all systems of one treatment. The shaded 407 area shows the 95% credible interval and indicates the uncertainty of an estimate. The 408 vertical lines indicate the times of exposure to esfenvalerate. Linear regression models 409 were fitted to the correlations in the post-exposure period.

401

To identify the temporal development of interspecific competition, correlations between
competitors were computed for each day in the monitoring period by fitting the model
(Eqs. 1–6) on interpolated and smoothed daily observations. Linear regressions were

413 computed to identify the treatment trends in competition in the post-exposure periods. We 414 observed that the significantly negative trend in the control treatment emerged shortly 415 after the exposure (p < 0.001), i.e., shortly after addition of manual stocking of *C. pipiens* 416 larvae to the systems was stopped. Figure 7a–c shows that after exposure to 0.1–10 ng/L 417 esfenvalerate correlations were significantly positive (p < 0.01). However, the trend in the 418 treatment exposed to 100 ng/L esfenvalerate was significantly negative (p < 0.001), 419 although the correlations substantially dropped only after the second exposure (Fig. 7d).

#### 420 Effects of Environmental Conditions

Neither physico-chemical parameters (e.g., temperature, oxygen) nor major nutrients 421 422 varied among the treatments during the post-exposure phase (Table 1). While exposure to 423 esfenvalerate significantly disturbed the population development of *D. magna*, the 424 remaining unexplained variance remained large (Fig. 5a). Pre-exposure environmental 425 parameters could not explain this variance (Fig. S2) as there were no significant 426 correlations. Only the pH was mildly positively correlated with the disturbance residuals (p 427 = 0.27). The concentration of major nutrients was the range of eutrophic lakes (Table S1), 428 however no significant positive or negative correlation with the final abundance of D. 429 magna or C. pipiens could be identified. Also, the correlation between pre-exposure 430 environmental parameters and the final abundance of *D. magna* and *C. pipiens* was 431 insignificant (Tables S5, S6).

#### 432 **Discussion**

433 In this study we investigated the effect of environmentally realistic esfenvalerate exposures 434 on a 2-species community in a highly competitive environment. We showed that exposing 435 competing species with similar sensitivities to esfenvalerate results in a substantial 436 reduction of interspecific competition at low concentrations, indicated by increasing 437 positive correlations between species. These effects were detected far below effect 438 concentrations established in standard tests, conducted in parallel to the experiment. The 439 exposure to esfenvalerate increased the correlation between *D. magna* and *C. pipiens* with 440 increasing levels of exposure, beginning as low as 3 orders of magnitude below the measured EC<sub>50</sub> (Fig. 6). Species correlations of treatments exposed to 0.1, 1 and 10 ng/L 441 442 significantly increased over time during the post-exposure period. On the contrary, the 443 concentration closest to the EC<sub>50</sub> (100 ng/L) decreased the correlation between species 444 and also provoked significant disturbances in the population of *D. magna*.

445 The systems studied in this work were highly limited in suspended biomass available for 446 nutrition (Tables 1, S1), due to the absence of external carbon inputs. For this reason, both 447 species showed a similar declining population trend (Fig. 4). This decrease can also be 448 attributed to low levels of primary production, approximated by the density of suspended 449 biomass (Table S1). We assume that sufficiently large concentrations of N and P could not 450 be converted to biomass in the studied systems. Possible reasons are strong competition of 451 filter feeders, which prevented growth phases of phytoplankton, or insufficient lighting conditions. In the absence of suspended biomass, organisms were observed to graze on 452 453 periphyton and biofilm, which were not quantified in this work but varied considerably 454 among the experimental replicates. Resulting from this diversity, dominance and 455 suppression of either species was approximately random, indicated by similar fractions of 456 low density-populations, which led to negative correlations between the species' population densities. This is associated with high interspecific competition between C. 457 458 *pipiens* and *D. magna* in the control treatments, which increased during the post-exposure 459 period (Fig. 7) after colonization of C. pipiens was stopped. These results fit the theory that 460 narrow environments with considerable niche overlap do not favor coexistence of 461 competing species (Pastore et al. 2021).

# 462 Exposure to high doses of esfenvalerate disturbs population and increases risk of single

## 463 species dominance

464 The exposure to esfenvalerate at 100 ng/L, induced significant, direct short-term 465 disturbances in Daphnia populations and decreasing correlations in the post-exposure 466 phase. Decreasing correlations indicate the suppression of one species, which could be 467 exploited by the dominant species if the composition of the system in terms of suspended 468 biomass, periphyton and biofilm allowed population growth. Since the variation between 469 biomass density and other environmental parameters across experimental replicates could 470 not explain the residual variance of the disturbance of species after exposure nor final population densities of either species, periphyton and biofilm may well have been 471 472 responsible for the heterogeneity in the systems. Due to this heterogeneity of the systems, 473 the observation of significant population level disturbance of esfenvalerate at 100 ng/L is 474 assumed to be very robust. The direct effect of esfenvalerate at 100 ng/L is also visible in 475 Figure 6d, where species abundances increasingly converge to one or the other axes. 476 Similar dynamic behavior has been observed for sub-populations of potato beetle larvae 477 and adults (Costantino et al. 1997); when harvesting rates of adult beetles were experimentally increased, comparable to direct mortality effects of 100 ng/L esfenvalerate in the present work, populations were pushed out of equilibrium. Although the experimental conditions are only partly comparable, the results show that disturbances of competing (sub)populations can lead the way to significant changes in the dynamic of ecological communities.

#### 483 Exposure to low doses of esfenvalerate reduces interspecific competition

484 From day 70, the control treatment showed a marked interspecific competition, indicated 485 by decreasing correlations. In contrast, treatments exposed to low doses of esfenvalerate 486 (0.1, 1, 10 ng/L) showed reduced interspecific competition, indicated by increasing 487 correlations. This already occurred at concentrations more than 3 orders of magnitude below the EC<sub>50</sub> and reached its maximum at 10 ng/L (Fig. 6e-g, Fig. 7a-c). These 488 489 observations support a recent simulation study, which predicts that the correlation 490 between populations of different species increases if interspecific competition is absent 491 because then development of both populations is driven only by environmental 492 fluctuations (Lee et al. 2020). In contrast, the same study predicts decreases in 493 interspecific correlations if high interspecific competition is present due to resulting 494 suppression of one or the other species. Such mechanisms are precisely those observed in 495 the present work. In another experimental study of marine environments, low pH led to 496 altered competitive interactions between competing algae species and gradually led to a 497 community shift (Kroeker et al. 2013). In a single species population study, exposure to 10 498 ng/L esfenvalerate reduced the competitiveness of *D. magna* and led to a hormetic increase 499 in population abundance (Schunck and Liess 2023). Such an effect did not occur in this 500 study. Instead, we assume that the presence of a competitor caused the absence of a 501 stimulatory population effect, suggesting that findings of hormesis are dependent on the 502 environmental context; i.e., only emerge when the environmental conditions do not 503 penalize trade-offs associated with stimulatory effects.

504 **Conclusion and Outlook** 

We show that concentrations 3 orders of magnitude below the  $EC_{50}$  induced reductions in the interspecific competition between *D. magna* and *C. pipiens*. In contrast, concentrations near the  $EC_{50}$  directly impacted *D. magna* populations and led to an increased tendency of single species dominance. The work also highlights, that single species sensitivity tests are insufficient to predict ecological effects on the community level. On the contrary, non-

- 510 invasive population monitoring is very a promising approach, which can complement the
- 511 higher tier risk assessment of ecological effects of toxicants, since the absence of sampling
- 512 removes the most error prone and disturbing part of the method. By monitoring the
- 513 correlation in abundance between competing species, more subtle effects can be detected
- 514 and potentially hazardous long-term effects can be identified before they occur in the field.

# 515 Supplementary Information

### 516 **CRediT authorship contribution statement**

517 Florian Schunck: Conceptualization, Investigation, Data curation, Formal analysis,

- 518 Visualization, Writing Original draft. Matthias Liess: Conceptualization, Investigation -
- 519 Guiding analytical cognition process, Writing.

# 520 Acknowledgements

- 521 The authors thank Franz Dussl, Oliver Kaske, Maren Lück, Mavi Kotan and Naeem Shahid
- 522 from the Department of System-Ecotoxicology of the Helmholtz Centre for Environmental
- 523 Science for their support and advice during the conduction of the experiment. This work
- 524 was partly funded from the European Union's Horizon Europe research and innovation
- 525 programme under Grant Agreement No 101057014 (PARC).

# 526 **References**

- Alexander AC, Culp JM, Baird DJ, Cessna AJ. 2016. Nutrient-insecticide interactions
  decouple density-dependent predation pressure in aquatic insects. Freshwater Biology.
  61(12):2090–2101. doi:10.1111/fwb.12711.
- Allen J, Gross EM, Courcoul C, Bouletreau S, Compin A, Elger A, Ferriol J, Hilt S, Jassey VEJ,
- Laviale M, et al. 2021. Disentangling the direct and indirect effects of agricultural runoff on
- 532 freshwater ecosystems subject to global warming: A microcosm study. Water Research.
- 533 190:116713. doi:10.1016/j.watres.2020.116713.
- Arce-Funck J, Crenier C, Danger M, Cossu-Leguille C, Guérold F, Felten V. 2016.
- 535 Stoichiometric constraints modulate impacts of silver contamination on stream
- 536 detritivores: An experimental test with gammarus fossarum. Freshwater Biology.
- 537 61(12):2075-2089. doi:10.1111/fwb.12785.
- 538 Beklioğlu M, Bucak T, Coppens J, Bezirci G, Tavşanoğlu Ü, Çakıroğlu A, Levi E, Erdoğan Ş,

539 Filiz N, Özkan K, et al. 2017. Restoration of eutrophic lakes with fluctuating water levels: A

540 20-year monitoring study of two inter-connected lakes. Water. 9(2):127.

541 doi:10.3390/w9020127.

#### 542 Costantino, Desharnais, Cushing, Dennis. 1997. Chaotic dynamics in an insect population. 543 Science (New York, NY) 275(5298):389–391. doi:10.1126/science.275.5298.389

- 544 Ebert D. 2022. Daphnia as a versatile model system in ecology and evolution. EvoDevo.
- 545 13(1):16. doi:10.1186/s13227-022-00199-0.
- 546 European Food Safety Authority. 2013. Guidance on tiered risk assessment for plant
- 547 protection products for aquatic organisms in edge–of–field surface waters: EFSA panel on 548 plant protection products and their residues (ppr). EFSA Journal. 11(7).

549 doi:10.2903/j.efsa.2013.3290.

- 550 Fleeger JW, Carman KR, Nisbet RM. 2003. Indirect effects of contaminants in aquatic
- ecosystems. Science of The Total Environment. 317(1-3):207–233. doi:10.1016/S00489697(03)00141-4.
- 553 Foit K, Kaske O, Wahrendorf D-S, Duquesne S, Liess M. 2012. Automated nanocosm test
- system to assess the effects of stressors on two interacting populations. Aquatic toxicology
- 555 (Amsterdam, Netherlands). 109:243–249. doi:10.1016/j.aquatox.2011.09.013.
- 556 Gause GF. 1936. The struggle for existence. Soil Science. 41(2):159.
  557 doi:10.1097/00010694-193602000-00018.
- 558 Gelman A, Jakulin A, Pittau MG, Su Y-S. 2008. A weakly informative default prior
- distribution for logistic and other regression models. The Annals of Applied Statistics. 2(4).
  doi:10.1214/08-A0AS191.
- Gessner MO, Tlili A. 2016. Fostering integration of freshwater ecology with ecotoxicology.
  Freshwater Biology. 61(12):1991–2001. doi:10.1111/fwb.12852.
- 563 Ghosh I, Marques F, Chakraborty S. 2021. A new bivariate poisson distribution via
- 564 conditional specification: Properties and applications. Journal of applied statistics.
  565 48(16):3025-3047. doi:10.1080/02664763.2020.1793307.
- 566 Hardin G. 1960. The competitive exclusion principle. Science (New York, NY).
- 567 131(3409):1292–1297. doi:10.1126/science.131.3409.1292.
- 568 Hawlena H, Garrido M, Cohen C, Halle S, Cohen S. 2022. Bringing the mechanistic approach
- 569 back to life: A systematic review of the experimental evidence for coexistence and four of
- 570 its classical mechanisms. Frontiers in Ecology and Evolution. 10.
- 571 doi:10.3389/fevo.2022.898074.
- 572 He F, Arora R, Mansour I. 2023. Multispecies assemblages and multiple stressors:
- 573 Synthesizing the state of experimental research in freshwaters. WIREs Water.:1–19. 574 doi:10.1002/wat2.1641.
- 575 Knillmann S, Stampfli NC, Beketov MA, Liess M. 2012. Intraspecific competition increases 576 toxicant effects in outdoor pond microcosms. Ecotoxicology (London, England).
- 576 toxicant effects in outdoor pond microcosms. Ecotoxicology (Lor
   577 21(7):1857–1866. doi:10.1007/s10646-012-0919-y.
- 5// 21(/).105/-1000. doi.10.100//310040-012-0919-y.
- 578 Knillmann S, Stampfli NC, Noskov YA, Beketov MA, Liess M. 2012. Interspecific competition 579 delays recovery of daphnia spp. Populations from pesticide stress. Ecotoxicology (London,
- 580 England). 21(4):1039–1049. doi:10.1007/s10646-012-0857-8.
- 581 Kroeker KJ, Micheli F, Gambi MC. 2013. Ocean acidification causes ecosystem shifts via
- altered competitive interactions. Nature Climate Change. 3(2):156–159.
- 583 doi:10.1038/nclimate1680.

- Lee AM, Saether B-E, Engen S. 2020. Spatial covariation of competing species in a
- 585 fluctuating environment. Ecology. 101(1):e02901. doi:10.1002/ecy.2901.
- 586 Liess M, Foit K. 2010. Intraspecific competition delays recovery of population structure.
- 587 Aquatic toxicology (Amsterdam, Netherlands). 97(1):15–22.
- 588 doi:10.1016/j.aquatox.2009.11.018.
- Liess M, Foit K, Becker A, Hassold E, Dolciotti I, Kattwinkel M, Duquesne S. 2013.
- 590 Culmination of low-dose pesticide effects. Environmental science & technology.
  591 47(15):8862-8868. doi:10.1021/es401346d.
- Liess M, Liebmann L, Vormeier P, Weisner O, Altenburger R, Borchardt D, Brack W,
- 593 Chatzinotas A, Escher B, Foit K, et al. 2021. Pesticides are the dominant stressors for
- 594 vulnerable insects in lowland streams. Water Research. 201:117262.
- 595 doi:10.1016/j.watres.2021.117262.
- Liess M, Pieters BJ, Duquesne S. 2006. Long-term signal of population disturbance after
  pulse exposure to an insecticide: Rapid recovery of abundance, persistent alteration of
  structure. Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry. 25(5):1326–1331. doi:10.1897/05466R.1.
- MacArthur RH. 1958. Population ecology of some warblers of northeastern coniferous
  forests. Ecology. 39(4):599–619. doi:10.2307/1931600.
- Mano H, Tanaka Y. 2016. Mechanisms of compensatory dynamics in zooplankton and maintenance of food chain efficiency under toxicant stress. Ecotoxicology (London,
- 604 England). 25(2):399–411. doi:10.1007/s10646-015-1598-2.
- McCarthy MA. 2011. Breathing some air into the single-species vacuum: Multi-species
  responses to environmental change. Journal of Animal Ecology. 80(1):1–3.
  doi:10.1111/j.1365-2656.2010.01782.x.
- McElreath R. 2015. Statistical rethinking: A bayesian course with examples in r and stan.
- 609 Merritt RW, Dadd RH, Walker ED. 1992. Feeding behavior, natural food, and nutritional
- relationships of larval mosquitoes. Annual review of entomology. 37:349–376.
  doi:10.1146/annurey.en.37.010192.002025.
- Moran PAP. 1953. The statistical analysis of the canadian lynx cycle. Australian Journal of Zoology. 1(3):291. doi:10.1071/Z09530291.
- 614 OECD. 2004. Test no. 202: Daphnia sp. Acute immobilisation test.
- 615 doi:10.1787/9789264069947-en.
- 616 Pastore AI, Barabás G, Bimler MD, Mayfield MM, Miller TE. 2021. The evolution of niche
- 617 overlap and competitive differences. Nature ecology & evolution. 5(3):330–337.
- 618 doi:10.1038/s41559-020-01383-y.
- 619 Pieters BJ, Liess M. 2006. Population developmental stage determines the recovery
- 620 potential of daphnia magna populations after fenvalerate application. Environmental 621 science & technology. 40(19):6157–6162. doi:10.1021/es0521800.
- Ranta E, Lindstrom J, Linden H. 1995. Synchrony in tetraonid population dynamics. Journal
  of Animal Ecology. 64(6):767. doi:10.2307/5855.

- 624 Salvatier J, Wiecki TV, Fonnesbeck C. 2016. Probabilistic programming in python using
- 625 pymc3. PeerJ Computer Science. 2:e55. doi:10.7717/peerj-cs.55.
- 626 Schunck F, Liess M. 2023. Ultra-low esfenvalerate concentrations increase biomass and
- 627 may reduce competitiveness of daphnia magna populations. The Science of the total 628 environment.:163916. doi:10.1016/j.scitotenv.2023.163916.
- 629 Serra T, Müller MF, Barcelona A, Salvadó V, Pous N, Colomer J. 2019. Optimal light
- 630 conditions for daphnia filtration. The Science of the total environment. 686:151–157.
- 631 doi:10.1016/j.scitotenv.2019.05.482.
- 632 Šorf M, Davidson TA, Brucet S, Menezes RF, Søndergaard M, Lauridsen TL, Landkildehus F,
- 633 Liboriussen L, Jeppesen E. 2015. Zooplankton response to climate warming: A mesocosm
- 634 experiment at contrasting temperatures and nutrient levels. Hydrobiologia. 742(1):185–
- 635 203. doi:10.1007/s10750-014-1985-3.
- 636 Vaugeois M, Venturelli PA, Hummel SL, Accolla C, Forbes VE. 2020. Population context
- 637 matters: Predicting the effects of metabolic stress mediated by food availability and
- 638 predation with an agent- and energy budget-based model. Ecological Modelling.
- 639 416:108903. doi:10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2019.108903.
- 640 Zhu H, Liu XG, Cheng SP. 2021. Phytoplankton community structure and water quality
- 641 assessment in an ecological restoration area of baiyangdian lake, china. International
- Journal of Environmental Science and Technology. 18(6):1529–1536. doi:10.1007/s13762 020-02907-6.